

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MINUTES

DATE: FEBRUARY 26, 2015

The City of Cincinnati's Civil Service Commission met in regular session in Room 307, City Hall on Thursday, February 26, 2015. Commissioners in attendance were Mr. James Robinson, Chair, Mr. Robert Braddock, and Mr. C. Freeman McNeal. Commission staff present included Ms. Georgetta Kelly, Civil Service Secretary, Ms. Nancy Olind, Assistant HR Director, Ms. Seeta Martindale, Recording Secretary, Mr. Darrell Ludlow, Senior Human Resources Analyst, Ms. Ornita Brown, Human Resources Analyst, Mr. Bruce Ross, Human Resources Analyst, Ms. Doris Adotey, Human Resources Analyst, Mr. Derrick Gentry, Human Resources Analyst, and Mr. Nosakhare Ekhatore, Human Resources Analyst.

AGENDA ITEMS

APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM THE 2/12/2015 MEETING. Minutes were previously routed and reviewed. Commissioner McNeal made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner Braddock seconded the motion. The Commission unanimously approved the minutes.

APPOINTMENT TO THE CLASSIFIED SERVICE:

Elizabeth Christenson to the position of Crime Analyst in the Police Department. This position was posted as an open-competitive exam. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for appointment to the classified service through the competitive process. The candidate met the minimum requirements for the position, competed and obtained a passing grade on the exam, met the needs of the department, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission approved this item.

Devin Reaves and Sidney Redmon to the position of Laborer in the Public Services Department. The staff provided information in accordance with Civil Service Rule 8, Section A for the appointment of Municipal Workers to permanent positions in the classified service. The candidates met the minimum requirements for the position, met the needs of the department, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department from a seniority list. The Commission approved this item.

MaryAnn Mittermeier to the position of Clerk Typist 1 in the Finance Department/Income Tax Division. This position was posted as an open-competitive exam. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for appointment to the classified service through the competitive process. The candidate met the minimum requirements for the position, competed and obtained a passing grade on the exam, met the needs of the department, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission approved this item.

Stephanie Brown to the position of Casework Associate in the Health Department. This position was posted as an open-competitive exam. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for appointment to the classified service through the competitive process. The candidate met the minimum requirements for the position, competed and obtained a passing grade on the exam, met the needs of the department, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission approved this item.

Alicia Renay Franklin to the position of Clerk Typist 3 in the Fire Department. This position was posted as an open-competitive exam. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for appointment to the classified service through the competitive process. The candidate

MINUTES cont'd...

met the minimum requirements for the position, competed and obtained a passing grade on the exam, met the needs of the department, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission approved this item.

Jeffrey Volz to the position of Water Works Valve Operator 1 in the Department of Water. This position was posted as an open-competitive exam. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for appointment to the classified service through the competitive process. The candidate met the minimum requirements for the position, competed and obtained a passing grade on the exam, met the needs of the department, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission approved this item.

Request from the Police Department to appoint (25) candidates to the position of Police Officer through the Lateral Entry Process. This position was posted as an open-competitive exam comprised of a Structural Oral Interview. All candidates underwent background checks, behavioral assessments and interviews. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for appointment to the classified service through the competitive process. These candidates met the minimum requirements for the position, competed and obtained passing grades on the exam, met the needs of the department, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. The candidates selected were: Krista Adams, Thomas Back, Shane Bining, Nicholas Davis, Stephen Francis, William Goetz, Corey Gould, Craig Graening, Robert Heiland, Taylor Howard, Kurtis Latham, Michael Lowe, Aaron McMillan, Trent Meucci, Justin Moore, Shawn Newman, Shawn Peoples, Mark Price, Dustin Reed, Thomas Sanders, Sidharth Sharma, Matt Simon, Kevin Sorrells, Richard Sullivan, and Philip Van Cleve. The Commission approved this item.

Quentaria Conlee, Janet New, Sarah Robers, Christine Hedger, Jason Perez and Andrea Serf to the position of Operator and Dispatcher (Lateral) in the City Manager's Office/Emergency Communications Center. This position was posted as an open-competitive exam. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for appointment to the classified service through the competitive process. These candidates met the minimum requirements for the position, competed and obtained passing grades on the exam, met the needs of the department, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission approved this item.

APPOINTMENT TO THE CLASSIFIED SERVICE: Non-Competitive

David Johnson and Jason Beckett to the position of Senior Computer Programmer Analysts in the Department of Sewers. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidates met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

Yann Le Gouvellec to the position of Assistant Treatment Superintendent (Water Works Supply-Maintenance) in the Department of Water. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the specific skills, background and experience, as well as, the required licensure from the state of Ohio EPA

MINUTES cont'd...

needed by the department. The candidate was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

Patricia Herlinger to the position of Supervising Environmental Safety Specialist in the Department of Sewers. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

Nina Zechella to the position of Medical Assistant in the Health Department. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and licensure needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

Kenyata Magette to the position of Dental Assistant in the Health Department. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and licensure needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

Tevis Foreman to the position of Public Health Educator in the Health Department. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

Shawntae Williamson to the position of Medical Assistant in the Health Department. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and licensure needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

Megan Baudendistel to the position of Graphic Designer in the Parks Department. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

Amber Gabriel to the position of Public Health Nurse 2 in the Health Department. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and licensure needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

Rachael Dennis to the position of Accountant in the Finance Department. CODE's legal representative, Niroshan Wijesooriya, of Minnillo & Jenkins Co. LPA, Attorneys at Law, was present at the meeting joined by CODE President, Mr. Steve Kallay. They requested to address this item and were permitted to speak. Ms. Ornita Brown, Human Resources Analyst, was also present as the Human Resources/Commission staff representative. CODE expressed dissatisfaction with the posting/selection process. CODE specifically expressed concern that the spouse of a CODE member applied for this position and stated their belief that the Human Resources Department was retaliating against the spouse and/or CODE because a candidate other than the spouse of a CODE board was to be exceptionally appointed. CODE further inquired about the notices provided to applicants. Commissioner McNeal asked if CODE had raised objections or endorsed other exceptional appointments. Mr. Wijesooriya stated that he was aware of one objection but no endorsements. Ms. Nancy Olind, Asst. Director of Human Resources, responded that the CODE 1st Vice President, had recently addressed the Commission and stated that for technology and finance positions, CODE supported the use of exceptional appointment. Ms. Olind also provided information that notice of an examination date would be provided to applicants required to compete and that several correspondences had already occurred between the spouse of the CODE board member and its legal representatives. CODE further stated that it was not given advance notice of this appointment and that its placement on the draft agenda had changed. Ms. Georgetta Kelly, Human Resources Director discussed that the draft agenda is subject to change prior to the Commission meeting, pending review, and also indicated that the CODE board member's spouse had previously applied for the position and was considered, but was not selected by the department. Commission was informed that the department has an urgent need to fill the position as there are several vacancies and critical pending financial reporting projects that are pending. The candidate for exceptional appointment, Ms. Dennis, exceeded the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills needed by the department, holds a Certified Public Accountant license, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. The Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the exceptional appointment of Ms. Dennis. The Commission noted CODE's concern.

Kristen Eatmon to the position of Supervising Management Analyst (Police Finance Management) in the Police Department. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidates met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and licensures needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

MINUTES cont'd...

Jay Frames, Stephen Vollman and Timothy Booker to the position of Electrical Maintenance Worker 2 in the Public Services Department. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidates met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Promotion

Carman Linder to the position of Administrative Specialist in the Department of Water. This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, was referred to the department and selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement. The Commission noted this item.

Donald Elsaesser to the rank of Police Sergeant in the Police Department. This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and earned a passing score on the exam, was referred to the department and selected by rank order within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement of the Fraternal Order of Police (FOP) contract. The Commission noted this item.

NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Transfer

Brandon Ashcraft to the position of Automotive Mechanic in the Parks Department. The Human Resources Department provided notice of the transfer of the candidate to the position of Automotive Mechanic in the Parks Department. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position, as well as, the specific needs of the department and was selected, based on the AFSCME contract, from among the applicants referred to the department. The Commission noted this item.

Louis Sand to the position of Supervisor of Parks/Recreation Maintenance and Construction in the Parks Department. The Human Resources Department provided notice of the transfer of the candidate to the position of Supervisor of Parks/Recreation Maintenance and Construction in the Parks Department. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position and was selected, based on the AFSCME contract, from among the applicants referred as meeting the specific needs the department. The Commission noted this item.

NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Transfer and Voluntary Demotion

Stephanie Baggett to the position of Storekeeper within the Department of Sewers. The Storekeeper position was announced as a transfer opportunity in compliance with Article XX of the AFSCME Collective Bargaining Agreement. The candidate applied for the Storekeeper position with the understanding that this action will require a voluntarily demotion from the position of a Structures Maintenance Worker. Since all parties were agreeable to the transfer and demotion, the Commission noted the transfer agreement and approved the voluntary demotion.

MINUTES cont'd...

NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Working out of Class

Mary Fliehman in the position of Senior Accountant in the Department of Sewers. This candidate was selected within the guidelines of the CODE contract to work out of class in the position of Senior Accountant. The candidate met the qualifications of this position and was the only employee in the employing unit/division with the specific skills and required experience to fulfill the current needs of the department. The Commission noted this item.

Carla Brown in the position of Senior Computer Programmer Analyst in the Department of Water. This candidate was selected within the guidelines of the CODE contract to work out of class in the position of Senior Computer Programmer Analyst. The candidate met the minimum qualifications, possessed the special skills required for the position, and was selected as one of the qualified and interested candidates within the employing unit to rotate temporarily in the position. The Commission noted this item.

Beth Keller in the position of Senior Administrative Specialist in the Department of Water. This candidate was selected within the guidelines of the CODE contract to work out of class in the position of Senior Administrative Specialist. The candidate met the qualifications of the position and was the only employee in the employing unit/division with the specific skills and required experience to fulfill the current needs of the department. The Commission noted this item.

James Boyle in the position of Supervising Parks/Recreation Coordinator in the Recreation Department. This candidate was selected within the guidelines of the CODE contract to work out of class in the position of Supervising Parks/Recreation Coordinator. The candidate met the qualifications of the position and was one among other employees, with the specific skills and required experience, to express interest in rotating through the position. The Commission noted this item.

NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Police Department Complement Increase

- a) The Human Resources Department is providing notice of the City Manager's decision to add (1) Police Sergeant to the Police Department's Table of Organization

The Commission noted this item.

ELIGIBLE LISTS: Request for Approval:

- a) Civil Engineering Technician 2 (Correction to Exam Title)

The Commission approved this item.

ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request for Approval of Exam Schedules

- a) Water Works Maintenance Crew Leader - Promotional
- b) Laboratory Technician 3 - Promotional

The Commission approved these items.

ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Cancellation and Postponement of Examination

- a) Automotive Mechanic Exam

The Commission noted the postponement and approved the rescheduled exam date.

MINUTES cont'd...

ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request for Approval of Special Examiners

- a. James Boyd, Shawn League and Don Elble for the Level 1A exam (Board of Education)
- b. Jeff Burgess, Kim Curry, Steve Homan, Lisa Lane, Dominic Murphy, Deborah Newman and Harriet Todd for the Laboratory Technician 3 exam
- c. William H. Weinheimer for the Civil Engineering Technician 3 exam

The Commission approved these items.

ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request for Approval of Test Review Materials

- a) Water Works Maintenance Field Supervisor (MSD) – Promotional Exam

The Commission approved this item.

CLASSIFICATION: Request for the approval of new and/or revised classification specifications:

- a) Department of Trade and Development:
 - i. Trade and Development Deputy Director
 - ii. Trade and Development Deputy Director (Special Project Administrator)
 - iii. Division Manager (Business Administration and Operations)
 - iv. Division Manager (Monitoring and Compliance)
- b) Development Manager (Economic Inclusion)
- c) Development Manager (Community Liaison)
- d) Wastewater Collection Inspector (MSD)

The Commission approved these items.

CLASSIFICATION: Request from Departments to add/delete positions to their table of organization:

- a. **Police Department:** Add (1) Administrative Technician
- b. **Department of Economic Inclusion:**
 - (1) Director of Economic Inclusion
 - (2) Deputy Directors
 - (4) Development Managers
 - (2) Senior Contract Compliance Specialists
 - (1) Administrative Technician
 - (1) Clerk Typist 3
 - (1) Senior Administrative Specialist
- c. **City Manager's Office/Division of Parking Facilities:** Add (6) Parking Enforcement Officers (Part-time)

The Commission approved these items.

APPEAL TO THE COMMISSION: Information Items:

a) Appeal Hearing Schedule:

Name	Scheduled for:
David Johnson	January 29, 2015 Hearing Cancelled/ Continuance requested by Appellant's Representative /To be Rescheduled
Richard Johnson	February 26, 2015 Hearing Cancelled/ Continuance requested by Appellant's Representative /To be Rescheduled
Phillip Jones	Continuance Requested/Coordinating New Hearing Date
Robert DeBonis	Appellant advised of status of Subpoenaed documents/ Scheduling Suspended
Daryl Ross	On Hold/Law Dept. Update: Criminal Case Decision in January – 2015
Banita Bell (Board of Education)	Appeal Hearing to be Scheduled

The staff provided information on the current Appeal Hearing Schedule. The Commission noted this item and requested follow-up regarding the hearing schedule.

APPLICATION FOR ENTRANCE EXAM:

Request from Kendra Dawson for reasonable accommodation for the Senior Sanitarian promotional exam. The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. Per Civil Service Rule 10 § 11, Ms. Dawson's request for reasonable accommodation fell within the guidelines of the rules and the Commission approved the request.

Request from Shirley Jones to appeal the rejection of her application for the position of Pharmacy Technician. The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

Request from Beverly McKenzie to appeal the rejection of her application for the position of Pharmacy Technician. The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

Request from Tisheena Steele to appeal the rejection of her transfer application for the position of Motor Equipment Operator 1. The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

MINUTES cont'd...

Request from Walter Schroder to appeal the rejection of his application for the position of Laboratory Technician 3. The candidate was present at the meeting and offered additional information relating to the request. Mr. Schroder discussed his time in grade 3 experience and why it should be considered in determining eligibility to take the examination. Mr. Bruce Ross, Human Resources Analyst with the City's Human Resources Department was also present. The Commission approved the request.

Request from Tracy Kump to appeal the rejection of her application for the position of Laboratory Technician 3. The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

Request from Micah Mapp to appeal the rejection of his application for the position of Electrical Maintenance Helper. The candidate was present at the meeting and offered additional information relating to the request stating that he was completing a four-year apprenticeship program. Ms. Doris Adotey, Human Resources Analyst with the City's Human Resources Department, was also present. The Commission denied the request.

Request from Devonna Hendrix to appeal the rejection of her application for the position of Sanitarian/Sanitarian in Training. The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

Request from Christopher Lindemann to appeal the rejection of his application for the position of Water Works Maintenance Crew Leader. The candidate was present at the meeting and offered additional information relating to the request. He was accompanied by Mr. Steve Metz, Vice-President of AFSCME, Local 109, and Mr. Chris McDonald, Vice-President of AFSCME, Local 240. Ms. Ornita Brown, Human Resources Analyst with the City's Human Resources Department was also present. The union expressed that its employees should be eligible to sit for a promotional test regardless of probationary status or be barred from movement due to the 12-month rule. The union acknowledged that a member may be restricted from receiving the promotion, but should be eligible to take the examination. Steve Metz, Vice President of Local 190 also approached the Commission to support the union's position of allowing members to test for promotional positions. This issue was ruled on by the Commission at its February 12, 2015 meeting. The Commission denied the request.

ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request to Appear Before Commission

Request from Kim Wubeler to appear before the Commission regarding notification for testing, and more specifically, notification for the Motor Equipment Operator 1 promotional exam. Ms. Wubeler was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. Mr. Kevin Sluder of AFSCME, Local 240 spoke out related to the matter from the back of the room. He did not approach the table as he stated he was not officially present to represent Ms. Wubeler. The Commission denied the request.

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION:

Important NeoGov On-Line Application glitch between February 11-16, 2015. A technical glitch related to the session timeout, which may have affected a small percentage of applicants applying on-line between February 11-16, 2015, was communicated to the City's Human

FEBRUARY 26, 2015

MINUTES cont'd...

Resources Department by the NeoGov Production Management staff. This was a global issue and not restricted to applicants of just the City of Cincinnati. The Commission staff provided this item to the Commission for informational purposes only. The Commission noted this item.

The legal representatives of the Cincinnati Organization of Dedicated Employees (CODE) Bargaining Unit have requested to address each item on the agenda per Civil Service Rule 2, Section 5. CODE Representative, Niroshan Wijesooriya, of Minnillo & Jenkins Co. LPA, Attorneys at Law, was present at the meeting and was joined by CODE President, Mr. Steve Kallay to address item #3-j on the agenda earlier during the meeting. CODE waived all other agenda items. The Commission heard the comments and noted the concerns.